Dear Member of Congress,

We are writing to communicate our concerns about the implications of the recent proposal by the U.S. government to renew full civilian nuclear energy cooperation with India.

We respect, and indeed support, efforts to improve ties between important nations such as the United States and India. However, any plan to provide nuclear technology or fissile materials to another country must not weaken non-proliferation standards, norms and mechanisms, nor increase the risk of nuclear weapons proliferation. Our assessment of the proposal is that it does not meet these tests.

This deal provides nuclear assistance to India without requiring them to submit all nuclear facilities to International Atomic Energy Agency Safeguards. It will exclude from safeguards a substantial set of military and civilian facilities. The NPT, on the other hand, requires comprehensive safeguards for all States except the five ‘official’ nuclear weapon States. This deal will thus encourage India to remain outside the Non-Proliferation Treaty (NPT) in order to avoid such safeguards.

In addition, it will be an encouragement for Pakistan and possibly Israel to seek equal arrangements with other suppliers of nuclear technology such as China.

Equally disturbingly is that it could lead states like Iran, currently subject to IAEA safeguards, to consider leaving the NPT in order to be able to obtain support for their civilian programmes without such stringent safeguards.

We believe that the U.S. proposal for civil nuclear cooperation with India will damage the nuclear non-proliferation regime and promises to do little to bring India any further into alignment with nonproliferation practices. In fact, it threatens the non-proliferation regime more than the absence of any deal.

Of utmost concern is the fact that the deal would permit India to import fissile materials for nuclear energy production, thus enabling India to use its limited uranium resources for the production of nuclear weapons. Indirectly, the deal would aid India’s efforts to increase its nuclear arsenal and thus fuel the nuclear arms race in South Asia.

Vague promises by India and the U.S. to support the achievement of a Fissile Material Cut-Off Treaty serve as empty rhetoric. The negotiations on such a treaty have been blocked in the Conference on Disarmament and there is no sign that these negotiations will commence or be successfully completed at any point in the foreseeable future. At the same time, India continues to reject calls to stop production of fissile materials for nuclear weapons purposes – a step that all recognised nuclear weapon states have undertaken. India also refuses to sign the Comprehensive Nuclear Test Ban Treaty like all other official nuclear weapon states have done. As such, the deal will severely undermine efforts to work towards confidence building and nuclear disarmament in South Asia.

We are calling on the governments participating in the NSG to not carve out an exemption from its export rules to accommodate the deal with India. Such an action by the NSG could lead other states to seek similar exemptions for their preferred partners and thus undermine compliance with the NPT and the non-proliferation regime.

Consequently, as long as India does not meet strict disarmament and nonproliferation standards, we will urge our governments to oppose a lifting of nuclear trade restrictions. Those of us who work in states that participate in the Nuclear Suppliers Group (NSG) have a particular responsibility in this respect because the consent of our
governments to a change in NSG guidelines is a precondition for India to get access to peaceful nuclear technology.

The U.S. government’s proposal would require significant exceptions to longstanding U.S. law and policy that restrict nuclear trade with states that do not accept full-scope international nuclear safeguards. Thus, U.S. Congress would have to be the first legislature to give its consent to a loosening of nuclear trade restrictions.

We respectfully ask you to prevent damage to the nuclear nonproliferation regime by applying the strictest standards before creating an exception for India and thus creating a loophole to nuclear nonproliferation rules that have been crafted so carefully over the past three decades.

We look forward to a further exchange of views with you as parliamentarians in NSG participating states debate the merits of the deal.

Sincerely,

Uta Zapf,
Member of the Bundestag; Deputy Spokeswoman for Foreign Policy of the Social Democrats in the Bundestag; Chair of the Subcommittee on Disarmament, Arms Control and Nonproliferation

Co-signed by:

Mª Rosario Fátima Aburto Balsega, Member of the Senate Foreign Affairs Commission, Spain

Senator Lyn Allison, Leader of the Democrats, Australia

Professor Kader Asmal M.P
former chair of Portfolio Committee on Defence, former Minister of Education, South Africa

John Austin MP, Member, International Executive Inter-Parliamentary Union, United Kingdom

Chris Ballance MP, Speaker for the Green Group on nuclear power and weapons, Scotland

Angelica Beer, Chairperson of the Delegation for Relations with Iran, Member of the Committee on Foreign Affairs, European Parliament

Raphael Chegeni, Secretary General of The Great Lakes Parliamentary Forum on Peace, Tanzania

David Coltart MP, Former Chairperson of the Parliamentary Select Committee for Justice, Legal and Parliamentary Affairs, Zimbabwe
Joe Comartin MP, Vice-Chair of the Committee on Public Safety and National Security, Canada

Frank Cook MP, Vice-President NATO Parliamentary Assembly, United Kingdom

Vera Dua MP, President of the Green Party of Flanders, Belgium

Deb Foskey MP, Member of the Standing Committee on Legal Affairs, Australia

Eloi Gloriuex, Member of the Regional Flemish Parliament, Belgium

Ana Maria Gomes, Vice-Chair of the Subcommittee on Security and Defence, European Parliament

John Gormley MP, Chairman and Foreign Affairs Spokesperson Green Party, Ireland

Ute Koczy MP, Speaker for Development Policy, Alliance 90/ The Greens, Germany

Jean Lambert, Member of the European Parliament

Keith Locke MP, Green Party Foreign Affairs Spokesperson, New Zealand

Hallgeir Langeland MP, Norway

Caroline Lucas, Principal Speaker for the Green Party, European Parliament

Senator Francesco Martone, Member of the Senate Foreign Affairs Committee, Italy

Maria Minna MP, Canada

Rolf Mützenich MP, Disarmament Political Speaker of the SPD parliamentary group, Germany

Winfried Nachtwei MP, Speaker for Security Policy and Disarmament affairs, Alliance 90/ The Greens, Germany

Senator Leo Platvoet, Member of the Commission for European Cooperation, Netherlands

René Röspel MP, Deputy-Chair of the Bundestag Sub-Committee on Environment, Environmental Protection and Nuclear Reactor Security, Germany
Paul Schäfer MP, Member of the Bundestag Sub-committee on Disarmament and Non-proliferation, Germany

Alan Simpson MP, Chair of Labour Against the War, United Kingdom

Juergen Trittin MP, Vice-Chair of the Parliamentary Group Alliance 90/ The Greens and Coordinator of the Working Group International Policy and Human Rights, Germany

Tarja Cronberg MP, Finland

Senator P. Galand MP, Vice-President of the Senate Committee on Foreign Relations and Defence, Belgium

Agne Hansson MP, Sweden

Kimmo Kiljunen MP, Finland

Senator Christine Milne, Australia

Austin Mitchell MP, Vice-convener All-Party Global Security and Non-proliferation Group, United Kingdom

Rüdiger Veit MP, Germany